

**Briefing Paper to the All Saints
Church Congregation on how to
make an effective submission in
support of the application by the
Anglican Diocese to redevelop and
strengthen
All Saints Church**

24 July 2020

For distribution at the gathering at All Saints Church on Sunday, 26 July 2020

By Vince Neall, Chairperson of the All Saints Church Building Advisory Board



Purpose

1. The purpose of this document is to help the members of the All Saints Congregation make an effective submission in support of the exciting and vital project to redevelop and strengthen All Saints Church.
2. The Palmerston North City Council has publicly notified the application and submissions can be filed using the approved forms in support of or in opposition to the proposal. Making your voice heard is important. Your submission will be considered whether or not you wish to speak in support of the proposal at the hearing.
3. This document will describe a range of values and goals the proposal seeks to promote because explaining these values provides a framework that will assist the Congregation to say in their own words why the application for resource consent should be granted.
4. The application will be considered by an independent commissioner at a public hearing.

Context

5. The purpose of the Resource Management Act is to enable communities to provide for their wellbeing while protecting existing values including heritage values to an appropriate extent.
6. In this case, the potential contest is between, on the one-hand, those people who consider that the building should be preserved in its current form to maintain its architectural authenticity irrespective of whether it serves the needs of the All Saints Church and its mission, and on the other hand, those people that consider a compromise is required that respects the current requirements of the All Saints Church Congregation while preserving most of the important heritage values of the existing church.
7. The reason members of the All Saints Church community should consider making a submission is because the submissions will:
 - (a) Provide tangible evidence of the values of the community that supports this project;

- (b) Convey ideas from the Congregation in their own words as to why those values will be supported by the granting of consent.
8. We would also like the support of the Congregation at the hearing. This has been a long journey with much voluntary work for the benefit of the All Saints Church community. Your support matters to us.

Values based planning

9. The District Plan provisions against which the resource consent will be assessed identifies a range of values attached to the existing building and site as well as to the needs of the Church community. All of these will be considered.
10. Those values include of course, the heritage values and how they are impacted by the proposed development. In addition, there are the values associated with the proposal that better enable the building to perform its intended function. These values are self-defined by the Congregation and should recognise the Church's role as a worshipping and apostolic community.
11. To assist the members of the Congregation to write a submission in their own words, what we provide in this paper is a summary of the values that we consider are important and that we believe are advanced by granting consent to the proposal. These can operate as sign posts to assist you to think about how you can express what you consider to be the positive features of this proposal.
12. We have structured the values or purposes of this proposal by a categorisation process. First, we have divided the core values and aims into the following seven value categories:
- (a) Spiritual/theological/liturgical and apostolic (SP);
 - (b) Church Community (CC);
 - (c) Place-Making (PM);
 - (d) Structural Safety (St);

- (e) Financial Viability (Ec);
- (f) Architectural (Arch);
- (g) Heritage Values (Her).

13. We then mark out for each category a number of value sub-categories expressing aims or values that the proposal advances. Each of the main seven value categories are addressed below. First, we introduce the basic idea of the value category and then summarise the value sub-categories we are trying to promote.

Spiritual/Theological/Liturgical and Apostolic Values

14. The first questions that any church has to ask itself is “why are we here?” and “what are we about?”. Any expenditure or effort on buildings is subject to these fundamental questions. It has been a long-standing view of the community that the entrance to the Church does not fulfil or portray its mission. This call for change started in 1982 when the then vicar, later a bishop, Brian Carrell talked about improving the entrance to All Saints Church. The Church has addressed this question continuously since then with greater urgency as the issue with the building’s seismic status has become more acute. The Conservation Plan prepared on behalf of the Church identifies the Church’s self-defined objectives under these basic categories:

- (a) Be a welcoming open church;
- (b) Be a hospitable church;
- (c) Be a versatile church facility;
- (d) Be an accessible church;
- (e) Be a safe church for the community;
- (f) Be a practical church;
- (g) Be a modern church.

15. All of those objectives are tied to the fundamental character of the All Saints Church mission and what it considers to be the contemporary expression of Christian community centred on a place of worship.
16. The values sub-categories that we are seeking to enhance and achieve under this Spiritual/Theological/Liturgical and Apostolic Value category are the following:
- (a) SP-V1¹ - Providing a central and welcoming entrance as opposed to the foreboding and illegible entrance of the current frontage. That change will also advance the apostolic mission to invite people to fellowship and worship;
 - (b) SP-V2² - Providing an area adjacent to the Church which is sheltered and provides people with a hospitable place after major events including weddings and funerals. At that point, after the service, there is an opportunity for gathering, communication and exchange that is a special fruit of the service already conducted;
 - (c) SP-V3³ - Providing additional spaces adjacent to the Church that afford opportunities for gathering and hospitality. The Church is a large church and not only can it host services but other events that celebrate appropriate activities such as singing, organ recitals and concerts;
 - (d) SP-V4⁴ - The visibility of the Church to the outside world is part of its apostolic mission. The current church has a strong sense of enclosure which does not manifest Christian fellowship in action to the wider community. It is central to the apostolic mission of the Church that people passing the place of worship can look in and gain a sense of what the community is about and what its values are. These are only tangibly done through a building that displays internal elements of the Church.

¹ Sp-V1 - Spiritual Value No. 1.

² Sp-V2 - Spiritual Value No. 2.

³ Sp-V3 - Spiritual Value No. 3.

⁴ Sp-V4 - Spiritual Value No. 4.

Church Community Values

17. The spiritual values are crucial to the Congregation's identity. However, worship is only part of the Congregation's activities and there are other needs that have to be met as part of the redevelopment. These have been generically described as Church Community Values for want of a better term. The value sub-categories are summarised below:

- (a) CC-V1⁵ - Being in the heart of Palmerston North. The All Saints Church community has a powerful tradition as one of the first occupants of a centrally located allotment in Palmerston North. There is a strong wish to remain where we are and to respect the traditions that exist both around the site and in the existing building;
- (b) CC-V2⁶ - A familiar place of worship. The Church does need a place of worship. It operates as a magnet for people wishing to gather. Closing the doors in 2013 resulted in an estimated drop of 40% visitation from foot traffic on the street seeking pastoral care and food, simply as a result of the absence of the street access;
- (c) CC-V3⁷ - Ready access to facilities including toilets. An important aspect of the design is creating linkages to the rear of the Church. The toilets are at the rear of the Church. The design provides for a side entrance into that linkage so that you do not have to leave by the Church's front doors. Access to these facilities for young families and older people is particularly important. Providing a covered space enables people to feel comfortable and to meet their needs in a discreet comfortable way;
- (d) CC-V4⁸ - Connection to the rear of the Church. The engine room for non-worship activities is the facilities at the rear of the Church. This includes the hall, the large cooking facilities and other side rooms. A central element of the

⁵ CC-V1 – Being in the heart of Palmerston North.

⁶ CC-V2 - A sense of Place.

⁷ CC-V3 - Access to facilities.

⁸ CC-V4 - Connecting to the facilities behind the Church.

design is creating linkages between these facilities and what will be the new ‘front end’ of the Church. This creates all sorts of efficiencies and benefits and adds to the life of the Church.

Place-Making Values

18. Place-making is an urban initiative to increase the vitality and activity occurring in public spaces and those spaces adjacent to them. The reason for that is that active enjoyable public spaces contribute enormously to community wellbeing. All Saints Church by reason of its central location can contribute to the liveability and vitality of Palmerston North’s most central space, The Square. The Palmerston North City Council has a place-making initiative and interestingly, the feature photograph is of people walking down the alley way adjacent to the All Saints Church.

19. There is a coincidence between increasing the redevelopment of All Saints Church and achieving these place-making goals. These are reflected in the values and purposes that have contributed to the final design proposal. The value sub-categories are summarised below:
 - (a) PM–V1⁹ - Activation of the frontage. Activation means that the interior and the exterior spaces are inviting and visibly show the activity that is occurring within the building. The high level of glazing in the proposal means that the following activities are visible to the public:
 - (i) Worship;
 - (ii) Hospitality and gathering;

An additional benefit is that the heritage fabric and elements of the building are also made more visible to the public;
 - (b) PM–V2¹⁰ - Street level activity. Activity at the street level is achieved because there are areas where people can gather protected from the elements during ceremonies marking significant life events. We all have memories of weddings

⁹ PM–V1- Activation of the frontage.

¹⁰ PM–V2 - Activity at street level.

and funerals where people are gathered and all of these events are critical to the function and life of the community and their visibility at the street level is important;

- (c) PM-V3¹¹ - Legibility. The building and the spaces around it need to be legible which means that people are able to visually see where the linkages are and how they relate to each other. Improved legibility will encourage greater understanding of how to access the building both as a place of worship and also passage to the rear parts of the building;
- (d) PM-V4¹² - Sovereignty. Place-making is a grass roots movement where communities themselves contribute to place-making by portraying their identity. The new improvements are an All Saints Church Congregation-based initiative to portray essential Christian values and to further the apostolic mission. The essence of place-making is the sovereignty of communities to express themselves and that is appropriately allowed for by this proposal while respecting the substantial portion of the existing building fabric.

Structural Safety Values

- 20. Making the Church safe is an essential and self-evident requirement. The option that has been selected is the least invasive and will be the least visible both internally and externally. The Anglican Diocese requires at least 67% of the New Building Standard (“NBS”) for seismic resilience. We discovered that the engineering method that we liked could achieve 100% of NBS. That means that there is improved safety but also some degree of redundancy built in the event that standards change which could always happen. The sub-values that have informed this value category are the following:
 - (a) St-V1¹³ - Safety. The work will dramatically improve the safety of people within the Church and in public spaces such as footpaths. Public safety is a pre-eminent consideration. This section of Church Street is designated as a high foot traffic area which means that public safety on the footpath and down the

¹¹ PM-V3 - Legibility.

¹² PM-V4 - Self-defined activity.

¹³ St-V1 - Safety.

alley ways is also important. Achieving 100% of the NBS is a significant step towards providing a safe environment;

- (b) St-V2¹⁴ - Preserves heritage. The benefit of the structural work is it preserves most of the existing heritage elements from significant seismic events. That includes protecting the tower which is a distinctive element of the Church. The engineers say that removing the baptistry provides the opportunity to install a concrete platform that will provide a secure base for the strengthening of the tower. The only material change to the fabric not affected by the redevelopment is the removal of the pinnacles and the replacement of them with modern facsimiles. These cannot be strengthened to an appropriate standard;
- (c) SC-V3¹⁵ - Legally Compliant. The new building will comply with all relevant regulations and laws and provides some redundancy in the event of increasing regulatory standards;
- (d) SC-V4¹⁶ - Future proofing. The engineering technique that is proposed provides a further element of redundancy. The wires used for tensioning could be replaced with other materials rather than steel, such as carbon fibre. These future materials may further increase the resilience of the building to seismic activity and be used with relatively small incremental costs.

Financial Viability Value

21. Good stewardship dictates that whatever is undertaken is financially viable for present and future generations. We have spent a lot of time refining the design including the method of earthquake strengthening to achieve the lowest cost possible. For example, we have changed the use of MacAllory bars to wires saving enormous expense. Even with that effort the total cost is going to be very significant and (over \$7 million) about 73% of that total cost represents cost of achieving structural stability and safety. The Anglican Diocese has made it plain that it will not approve significant expenditure on a building that is not fit for purpose. The Anglican Diocese has neither the will or

¹⁴ St-V2 - Heritage preservation.

¹⁵ St-V3 - Legal compliance.

¹⁶ St-V4 - Future proofing.

resources to support initiatives that are not supportive of the fundamental mission of the Church. The value sub-categories that have informed the financial viability aspects of the development include the following:

- (a) Ec-V1¹⁷ - Diocesan approval. The proposal has Diocesan approval because in combination with the structural strengthening (which is a significant portion of the total cost) other features will be built into the design that meet the Christian mission as summarised in the Spiritual (Sp) and Church Community (CC) values;
- (b) Ec-V2¹⁸ - Financial risk management. The proposal represents the least financial risk for the All Saints Church Congregation. The reason for that is that this proposal provides for a modern church and meets contemporary needs. Therefore, the proposal represents the best option for maintaining the vitality and strength of the All Saints Church Congregation. That is an essential element for creating a financially viable building programme that involves not only upgrading but also maintains the facility.

Architectural Values

- 22. The architectural elements of the new addition incorporate many of the important values already listed above. The form of the design is governed by the need to functionally promote those values. The design achieves that goal very well. The ‘look’ is a matter of design and matters of design can elicit responses ranging between love and hate with no particular rational basis for either response. It is a subjective response. Any design that meets the functional requirements is likely to elicit the same responses. Through consultation we have achieved a unity of purpose to promote this design.
- 23. Before advancing the design, we consulted with Heritage New Zealand. The most important message that they conveyed to us was that any new addition should not mimic the style of the existing building which would be completely false. It needed to be a contemporary component that was distinctive and new and could not be confused with

¹⁷ Ec-V1 - Diocesan approval.

¹⁸ Ec-V2 - Financial risk management.

original elements. We took on board that message. Around the world you can see existing churches that have had additions to them of a distinctive and contemporary style in just the same way as this proposal. The values that therefore have informed the architectural design are the following:

- (a) Arch–V1¹⁹ - Contrast. Creating a contrast with the existing building so that the new addition is both contemporary and distinctive but which relates to the existing building in a symbiotic way;
- (b) Arch–V2²⁰ - Organic. The material is organic in the sense of portraying naturalness as a contemporary value that celebrates nature and life. That vernacular also sits comfortably in contrast to the heraldic vernacular portrayed by the existing All Saints Church;
- (c) Arch–V3²¹ - Honest materials. The use of honest contemporary materials that provide a contrast to the masonry work but which sits with that in a complementary way;
- (d) Arch–V4²² - Visibility of the tower. Retaining the visibility of the tower as a clean form is a key value. An early design of the additions was further refined by removing a portico adjacent to the tower to maintain the integrity of the tower as it is a distinctive and important architectural element of the All Saints Church.

Heritage Values

24. The architectural elements of the All Saints Church have heritage value. It is important however not to think of heritage as only building fabric. The area on which the Church sits has been occupied for 145 years by the Anglican Church and the operation of the Church's mission in that place is an important aspect of the heritage of that place. In addition, an often overlooked element of the heritage of the All Saints Church is the contents within the Church. These cannot all be enumerated here. Of particular significance is the fact that the memorabilia of the Wellington Regiment that travelled

¹⁹ Arch–V1 - Contrast.

²⁰ Arch–V2 - Organic.

²¹ Arch–V3 - Honest materials.

²² Arch–V4 - Visibility of the Tower.

to Gallipoli is inside the All Saints Church. The Church is an important treasury of historical elements that are part of Palmerston North's history. The proposed development will retain 97% of the external fabric and almost 100% of the internal elements of the Church. The only changes are the relocation within the church of the font and the foundation stone, and the glass windows in the baptistry will be relocated to the new south corridor and not lost. This preservation of the predominance of the heritage fabric is a significant achievement with this redevelopment proposal.

25. The organ is also a heritage item. It was constructed in about 1926 by George Croft & Son in Auckland. Because of the way in which the strengthening is designed the organ does not need to be removed and stored. Removal and storage significantly elevate the risk of the organ losing its functionality. The heritage values that have therefore informed the redesign include the following:
- (a) Her-V1²³ - Fidelity to tradition and the place;
 - (b) Her-V2²⁴ - Preservation of the internal elements;
 - (c) Her-V3²⁵ - Preservation of most of the external fabric.

Vince Neall
Chairperson
All Saints Church Building Advisory Board

²³ Her-V1 - Fidelity to tradition and the place.

²⁴ Her-V2 - Preservation of the internal elements.

²⁵ Her-V3 - Preservation of most of the external fabric.